

(*Synaptolopis*), des *Stephanodaphneae* (*Stephanodaphne*) et des *Phalerieae* (*Peddiea*). On voit immédiatement que cet ensemble est loin d'être homogène.

De la présence du phylum des *Dicranolepideae*, qui d'après la répartition de ses endémiques, est africano-brésilien, et de celle du phylum australo-indo-malgache des *Phalerieae*, on peut conclure que Madagascar a conservé à l'époque actuelle des Thyméléacées tirant leur origine des peuplements respectifs de ces deux anciens continents.

La présence des genres *Gnidia* et *Dais*, représentés des deux côtés du canal de Mozambique par des espèces assez voisines, doit manifestement s'interpréter comme un témoignage des connexions tertiaires africano-malgaches. Quant au genre *Lasiosiphon*, son aire comprend aussi l'Arabie méridionale et ne permet donc pas de le considérer comme un témoin d'anciennes connexions entre l'Inde et Madagascar.

**ON *CIRSIUM LANCEOLATUM* HILL AND *C. LANCEOLATUM*
(L.) SCOP.**

par H. K. AIRY SHAW

(Royal Botanic Gardens, Kew, England)

In *Not. Syst.* xii. 17 (1945), just received at Kew (19.ii.46), M. J. Arènes asserts, with reference to my paper in *Fedde, Repert. Spec. Nov.* xliii. 302 (1938), that « la prétendue non-synonymie entre *Cirsium lanceolatum* Scop. (1772) et *Cirsium lanceolatum* Hill (1769) n'est pas défendable ». In my original paper I set out the facts of this case, but perhaps failed, through undue brevity, to make the position perfectly clear. There is, in actual fact, no doubt whatsoever as to the « non-synonymy » of *Cirsium lanceolatum* Hill and *C. lanceolatum* (L.) Scop., and it therefore seems desirable, in view of M. Arènes' contention, to present the case in greater detail.

Dr. John Hill, in his *Herbarium Britannicum, exhibens plantas Britanniae indigenas secundum methodum floralem novam digestas* (London, 1769), gave a somewhat detailed and analytical treatment of the *Compositae*, or *Congregatae* as he termed them. He divided them into five Classes : *RADIATAE* (*Bellis*, etc.), *TUBULATAE* (*Tanacetum*, *Conyza*, *Eupatorium*, *Artemisia*, *Gnaphalium*), *LIGULATAE* (*Sonchus*, etc.), *ASSOCIATAE* (*Cirsium*, etc.), and *AGGREGATAE* (a hotch-potch of *Dipsacus*, *Scabiosa*, *Statice*, *Astrantia*, *Eryngium*, etc.). I give, below, a synopsis of his account of the *ASSOCIATAE* (*l. c.*, i. 64-85), in order to make it clear just how the two species in question were fitted into the general picture. Names in square brackets are synonyms actually cited by Hill.

Classis quarta. *ASSOCIATAE*.

Calyce foliaceo.

I. *CARLINA* (1, *C. vulgaris*, Wild Carline Thistle).

Calyce squammato.

Familia prima (*squammis spinosis*).

Ordo primus (*squammis apice tantum armatis*).

I. *POLYCANTHA* (1, *P. Acanthoides*, Watted May Thistle ; 2, *P. palustris*, Marsh May Thistle ; 3, *P. crispa*, Thistle upon Thistle ; 4, *P. acaulos* [sic !], Dwarf May Thistle).

II. *ASCALEA* (1, *A. nutans*, Musk Thistle ; 2, *A. lanceolata* †, Spear Thistle).

III. *ONOPORDON* (1, *O. Acanthium*, Cotton Thistle).

IV. *IXINE* (1, *I. arvensis* [*Serratula arvensis*, i. e. *Cirsium arvense*], Way Thistle).

V. *TETRALIX* (1, *T. eriophora*, Woolly-headed Thistle).

Ordo secundus (*squammis apice et lateribus armatis*).

I. *MARIANA* (1, *M. lactea*, Lady's Thistle).

II. *CALCITRAPA* (1, *C. stellaris* [*Centaurea stellaris*], Crimson Star Thistle).

III. *SOLSTITIARIA* (1, *S. flava* [*Cent. solstitialis*], Yellow Barnaby Thistle).

Familia secunda (*squammis hirsutis*).

Ordo primus (*squammis hirsutis ; pila simplicia ad apicem*).

I. *BARDANA* (1, *B. Arctium*, Woolly Burdock ; 2, *B. minor*, Lesser Burdock ; 3, *B. Lappa*, Common Burdock).

II. *CIRSIUM* (1, *C. lanceolatum* † [*Carduus dissectus*], Lanced Gentle Thistle ; 2, *C. montanum* [*Serratula alpina*, i. e. *Saussurea alpina*], Mountain Gentle Thistle ; 3, *C. helenoides* [sic !], Melancholy Thistle).

Ordo secundus (*squammis ciliatis*).

I. CYANUS (I, *C. segetum* [*Centaurea Cyanus*], Corn Bluebottle).

II. JACEA (I, *J. nigra*, Common Knapweed).

III. SAGMEN (I, *S. jaceoides* [*Centaurea Scabiosa*], Knapwort Harshweed).

Familia tertia (*squammis nudis*).

I. SERRATULA (I, *S. tinctoria*, Common Sawwort).

I have marked two names with a dagger † — *Ascalea lanceolata* and *Cirsium lanceolatum*. Here are Hill's descriptions of the two genera and species concerned :

Genus II. ASCALEA. BANK THISTLE. Tab. 51. Calyx inflatus. Squam-
mae lineares, ad apicem retroflexae. [p. 72].

2. ASCALEA LANCEOLATA. SPEAR THISTLE. Folia hastata, pinnatifida ;
caulis pilosus. Tab. 51, fig. 2.

Caulis quadripedalis, durus, ramosus, multiflorus. Folia sordide virentia,
decurrentia, hispida. Flores magni, sanguinei ; calycibus spinosis et vil-
losis. Biennis. Ad sepium aggeres et in incultis vulgatissima. Julio flo-
rens. Variat capitulis minoribus, et floribus albis. [pp. 72-73].

Genus II. CIRSIUM. GENTLE THISTLE. Tab. 56. Calyx cylindricus ;
pilae rectae. [p. 80].

1. CIRSIUM LANCEOLATUM. LANCED GENTLE THISTLE. Foliorum spinae
inermes. *Carduus dissectus*. *English Soft Thistle*. Tab. 56, fig. 2.

Caulis bipedalis, et ultra ; lentus, pallidus, alatus. Folia decurrentia,
denticulata, obscure viridia. Flores magni, rubicundi, terminales. Bien-
nis. In locis humidis, et ad fluviorum ripas. Rarior*. Julio florens. [p. 80].

* *Leicester, Wiltshire.*

It will be evident from the above extracts that the Spear Thistle, *Carduus lanceolatus* Linn., is represented by Hill's *Ascalea lanceolata*, not by his *Cirsium lanceolatum*, even though the synonym *Carduus lanceolatus* L. is not cited by Hill. Several features of his description of the *Ascalea* clearly indicate the Spear Thistle : « squammis spinosis » (under Familia prima) ; « caulis quadripedalis, ... ramosus, multiflorus » ; and the habitat, « Ad sepium aggeres et in incultis vulgatissima ». It is equally clear that Hill's *Cirsium lanceolatum* is the Meadow Thistle, from the synonym *Carduus dissectus*, the English names « Lanced Gentle Thistle » and « English Soft Thistle », the items in the diagnosis and description, « Foliorum spinae

inermes » ; « Caulis bipedalis... Folia... denticulata » ; and the habitat, « In locis humidis, et ad fluviorum ripas. Rarior. » The figures cited (t. 51, fig. 2 ; t. 56 [fig. 1]), though somewhat formalised, nevertheless leave little room for doubt as to the identity of the species intended. And finally, by a simple process of elimination, Hill's *Ascalea lanceolata* and *Cirsium lanceolatum* must be the Spear Thistle and Meadow Thistle respectively, for the only thistle not otherwise accounted for in his treatment is *Carduus pycnocephalus*, which could hardly be put forward as a possible identification for either of them.

It thus follows that *Cirsium lanceolatum* (L.) Scop. *Fl. Carn.* ed. 2, ii. 130 (1772) is a later homonym of *Cirsium lanceolatum* Hill, *Herb. Brit.* i. 80 (1769). The latter was admittedly an illegitimate *nomen novum* for *Carduus dissectus* L. *Sp. Pl.* ed. 1, 822 (1753), but it nevertheless invalidates any later homonym. I have discussed the case with my colleagues Messrs. E. Milne-Redhead and N. Y. Sandwith, of Kew, and also with Mr. J. E. Dandy, of the British Museum, and they are in full agreement with the conclusions here presented. It is unfortunate that M. Arènes has published a large number of infra-specific group-names (*l. c.* 18-42) under the illegitimate name, and imaginary combination, *Cirsium lanceolatum* « (L.) » Hill.

I am indebted to M. Arènes for pointing out Tenore's use of the combination *Cirsium vulgare* (Savi), which I unfortunately overlooked. I am somewhat consoled for the oversight by the fact that the *Index Kewensis* (1895-1938), Petrak (*Cirsioth. Univ.* iv. 33 : 1912) and Mansfeld (*Fedde, Repert. Spec. Nov.* xlvii. 161 : 1939) overlooked it also !
